

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
OFFICIAL MINUTES  
NOVEMBER 21, 2012**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

**PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer**

**ABSENT: Tak, Salas, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

- Chairman's Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

**Adoption of 2013 HDRC meeting schedule.**

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Guarino to adopt the 2013 HDRC meeting schedule.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- |                      |  |
|----------------------|--|
| 1. Case No. 2012-310 | Brazos Street between Guadalupe and San Fernando |
| 2. Case No. 2012-313 | 422 King William                                 |
| 3. Case No. 2012-309 | 1440 S.E. Military Dr.                           |
| 4. Case No. 2012-189 | 231 Losoya                                       |
| 5. Case No. 2011-191 | 116 Princess Pass                                |
| 6. Case No. 2012-019 | 412 E. Commerce                                  |
| 7. Case No. 2012-293 | 205 Camargo                                      |
| 8. Case No. 2012-311 | 126 Losoya                                       |
| 9. Case No. 2012-308 | 2801 N. St. Mary's St.                           |

Commissioner Carpenter pulled item 4 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Guarino pulled item 8 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff recommendations.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**8. HDRC NO. 2012-311**

Applicant: Terry Corless

Address: 126 Losoya

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for conceptual approval to:

1. Construct a freestanding, "to-go" kiosk beneath the Losoya Street Bridge along the Paseo del Alamo. Materials will consist of stone facing;
2. Construct new, approximately 100 square-foot addition to Hyatt building along the Paseo del Alamo to accommodate new ADA bathroom;
3. Modify exterior of tenant space of Hyatt building along the Paseo del Alamo to include stone facing and exterior lighting;
4. Remove 5 trees located within the proposed outdoor dining space;
5. Construct new, 18" stone wall to define outdoor dining space per TABC regulations. The wall will be set back from the water edge to allow for minimum pedestrian walkway of 72"; and
6. Display tables, benches, and umbrellas in front of establishment to furnish outdoor dining space.

This application was reviewed by staff and one member of the Design Review Committee on November 13, 2012. At that meeting, the Commissioner present noted that the design should be modern in response to the setting of the Paseo del Alamo, and that careful attention should be given to the styling of the space to avoid the introduction of conjectural elements. The applicant agreed to eliminate such elements such as the use of rubble stone, arched openings, ornate railings, and gothic-styled light fixtures. It was agreed that cut-stone would be a more suitable material for this location. It was also noted that the proposed stone wall should be set back as far as possible to allow for a wider pedestrian walkway.

Staff finds that some updating of the tenant space and adjacent patio space is needed to distinguish the location and to help provide an active edge along this portion of the RiverWalk. Staff finds that the freestanding kiosk is sited in a location that is unobtrusive and will not impede pedestrian traffic or result in queuing along the RiverWalk. Staff also finds that the proposed stone facing is in keeping with this portion of the RiverWalk.

Staff finds that the trees being removed are Crepe Myrtles and are not recommended for use in the downtown area. Staff finds that planters will be incorporated into the new design to mitigate the removal of existing landscape elements. Staff further finds that the low wall has been positioned to provide a clear line-of-sight for pedestrians along the Paseo del Alamo, and that proposed benches and umbrellas are simple in design and do not produce unwanted visual clutter. Staff finds that the request is in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 9 and UDC sections 35-672, 35-673 and 35-674.

Staff recommends approval of all items with the stipulations a cut-stone facing be applied to the exterior surfaces rather than the rubble stone pattern that is illustrated in the submitted drawings, and that conjectural style elements, such as the proposed gothic light fixtures, be removed from the design in favor of a more modern aesthetic.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to grant conceptual approval of the drawings presented to HDRC on November 21, 2012.

**AYES:** Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer

**NAYS:** None

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**10. HDRC NO. 2012-302**

Applicant: George Rapier

Address: 535 E. Craig Place

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install solar panels mounted to the front (southern) facing roof of the main, southernmost structure on the property;
2. Install a standing seam metal roof on the southernmost structure. Seams will be no taller than 1 ½" and the roof will not feature a ridge cap vent, rather a flush-mounted cap will be installed. Finish color will be a charcoal gray to better match the requested solar panels; and
3. Install solar panels mounted to the front (southern) facing roof of the rear, northernmost structure on the property.

The panels requested are black and measure approximately 39" x 65" each and are approximately 2" thick. The panels would be mounted to the roof seams on the southernmost structure via clips for a total raised height of approximately 4-5".

Staff finds that there are two residential structures located on this property. Both structures are side-gabled and oriented east-to-west. Staff finds that the location of street-facing panels is not typically recommended due to the high visibility of the panels from the street, however solar panels at this location may be considered if the panels are of a low profile and similar color as the roof surface. Staff also finds that the proposed mounting method, although not flush with the roof plane, will allow for a low profile and is consistent with Section 7 of Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction. Staff further finds that the requested roof color is darker than the standard galvalume that is typically recommended within historic districts per Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations. However staff finds that a roof of darker color will more closely match the color of the solar panels and will help to reduce their visibility.

Staff also finds that the installation of panels on the northernmost structure would not be visible from the street, so no negative impact is expected from the installation of panels on south side of the northernmost structure.

1. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Staff recommends utilizing solar panels in a location that is not as visually prominent.
2. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Rather, a standard galvalume finish is recommended.
3. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve the drawings presented at HDRC on November 21, 2012.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer**

**NAYS: Guarino**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**11. HDRC NO. 2012-294**

Applicant: David Ericsson

Address: 918 N. Pine

The applicant is requesting a certificate of appropriateness to:

1. Remove existing fascia brick and metal parapet on the front (east) addition to reveal existing CMU backup wall and infill all remaining openings with matching CMU. The remaining wall is intended to reveal the original 1920's façade and create an entry courtyard. The courtyard will be enclosed by a gate clad in horizontal wood slats;
2. Remove deteriorated roof and diagonal wall on the front (east) addition;
3. Remove existing paint from brick and waterproof existing perimeter walls;
4. Remove brick infill on one bay on south façade and replace with wood panel overhead door and single-leaf entry;
5. Replace 2 over 2, metal windows with wood picture windows on south and north façades;
6. Replace 2 over 2, metal windows on west façade with combination wood panels and hoppers; and
7. Implement open-air, interior courtyard on northeast corner, retaining existing window openings and reclaimed fans.

Staff conducted a site visit for the property on November 13, 2012. At that time, it was noted that the existing, hollow, metal sash windows were damaged and in need of repair or replacement. Staff finds that an identical, in-kind replacement is not feasible due to the uncommonness of windows.

Staff finds that this structure was originally constructed in 1928 (Sanborn) as the Acme Steam Laundry. Staff finds that this structure is contributing to the Dignowity Hill Historic District, although it was not noted as such during the time of the survey due to a non-contributing addition that concealed the street-facing façade. Staff finds that the proposed alterations to the east façade will further distinguish the addition from the original structure. Staff finds that the removal of paint from the historic masonry will be an enhancement to the structure, and is in keeping with Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Section 2.

Staff finds that the replacement of the brick infill on the south façade with the wood doors will not be highly visible from the street, and will be distinguishable a modern alteration. This request is in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 9.

Staff further finds that the original metal sash windows are a character-defining feature of the structure, and any replacement should be similar in design to the original windows. The replacement of the original metal sash windows with wood, picture windows is not in keeping with Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Section 6.

1-4. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings.

5&6. Staff does not recommend approval, rather a metal window with a similar light configuration should be installed.

7. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve as requested with the stipulation that the applicant store all existing windows.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**12. HDRC NO. 2012-312**

Applicant: El Tenorio

Address: 630 Leigh Street

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for conceptual approval to:

Construct two, new residential structures at 626 and 630 Leigh Street, which are being re-platted as a single parcel. The two new structures will be spaced and oriented to maintain the existing development pattern along Leigh Street. Both structures will be contemporary in design and consist of materials including stucco, metal, and stained wood cladding.

1. Construct a 2-story residential structure with basement with a building footprint of approximately 1,100 square feet. This structure will have a front yard setback of approximately 25 feet. The structure will feature a single-sloped roof with a standing seam metal roof. Windows will be wood casement windows and multi-light fixed windows.
2. Construct a 2-story garage and residential loft with a building footprint of approximately 750 square feet. The structure will have a front yard setback of approximately 10 feet. The structure will feature a single-sloped roof with a standing seam metal roof. Windows will be wood casement windows and multi-light fixed windows. Two wooden overhead garage doors are to have frontage along Leigh Street. A crushed granite driveway with additional parking spot will be located immediately in front of the garage.
3. Install a front yard fence to be no taller than 4 feet tall.
4. Install a 6' cedar privacy fence along the side and rear property lines.

This application was reviewed by staff and one member of the Design Review Committee on November 13, 2012. At that meeting, the Commissioner present noted that the proposed design seemed appropriate for the district, and that due to the number of vacant adjacent lots, there is not much historic context for the design to respond to.

Staff finds that the proposed new construction is consistent with this block of Leigh Street in terms of building orientation, setback, lot coverage, and materials, and is consistent with Sections 1 and 3 of Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction. Staff also finds that the window openings with frontage along Leigh Street will be composed of units that are of a traditional window dimension, and are placed in a manner that maintains a relationship of solids to voids that is consistent with nearby historic structures. This is in keeping with Section 3 of Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction.

Staff further finds that the proposed garage would be too prominent along Leigh Street, and that a greater setback for the structure would be more appropriate per Section 5 of Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction. Staff finds that the additional gravel parking area will be buffered from the street with landscaping elements, and encourages further integration of the driveway and parking area into the landscape. Staff finds that front yard fences are common in the Lavaca Historic District, but are not evident along this part of Leigh Street. The design and materials of any new fence should respond to those found elsewhere within the district per Section 2 of Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements.

1. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings.
2. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that the garage structure have a greater setback than the main residence in order to read visually as a secondary structure, and that the garage doors have a similar cladding or coloration as the façade on which they are located in order to visually less prominent.
- 3&4. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that materials and construction be consistent with other fences located within the district.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to grant conceptual approval with the stipulation that the massing of the garage structure be further studied to reduce its scale. The garage doors to be studied so that they are less obtrusive from the street. The paving scheme be further developed.

November 21, 2012

6

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**4. HDRC NO. 2012-189**

Applicant: Beaty Palmer Architects

Address: 231 Losoya

Reset to December 5, 2012 due to loss of quorum.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:00 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone  
Chair